

Joint Nature Conservation Committee

Offshore Tranche Three MCZ Stakeholder

Workshop Report

1. Introduction

This report provides a summary of the two-day Tranche Three Marine Conservation Zones (MCZ) stakeholder workshop organised by JNCC and held in Bristol on November 14th / 15th 2016.

The workshop was an important stage in the designation process for Marine Conservation Zones which started in 2009. Defra envisage Tranche Three being the final Tranche which will essentially complete the MPA network in Secretary of State waters. JNCC has worked on these proposals in detail and the Tranche Three reports and advice documents are available here: <http://jncc.defra.gov.uk/page-7119>

The event had two main aims.

- Day 1 introduced the need for additional MCZs to fill shortfalls in the UK MPA network, set out the current Areas of Search and explored the options around these sites.
- Day 2 focussed on discussion of management options for these new sites and on the conservation advice being produced by JNCC.

2. The participants

31 people registered to attend the event, from 110 who were originally invited. A full list is in Annex 1. These represented a strong range of stakeholders including representatives from France and Belgium. The workshop guide (see section 3 below) and all relevant materials were made available to all invitees whether they could attend or not so they could still make an input.

A range of stakeholders was critical to the success of the event, since the intention was to understand their views and concerns and to ensure that all participants had an equal opportunity to be involved in exploring the options.

3. The conference structure

The conference started at midday on Day 1 (to allow for significant travel by some delegates). A full guide to the workshop was prepared in advance and is available at: <http://jncc.defra.gov.uk/page-7325>

- **The first session** focused on setting the national picture and background to this work. It was stressed that this event is for discussing and exploring options. It was not to fix and

finalise nor to legitimise a 'done deal'. This is an essential part of the work for the 3rd and final Tranche, and once this is done the work is completed.

- Paul McLeod of Defra presented the policy context.
- Jon Davies (MPA Programme Leader at JNCC) set out the work of JNCC on this programme and the three components of the T3 advice.
- Hannah Carr (Senior MPA Advisor, JNCC) provided an overview of the methodology and the high level results of JNCC's MPA network analysis along with information on the approach adopted for identifying options for filling the gaps identified.

Some initial questions were raised about how far the percentage targets under discussion for each area will completely meet the shortfalls and about how those targets were developed. There were concerns about how proposed sites in the Channel relate to similar work by the French government, and about why, if a feature is protected from fishing, aggregate removal may be permitted in some of the same areas.

- **The second session** (after lunch) started with presentations by
 - Pete Chaniotis (Senior MPA Advisor, JNCC) on the four Areas of Search (AoS) that were to be considered in the following small group discussions.
 - Heidi Pardoe (Natural England Project Manager, Marine Conservation Zone Designations) provided information on NE's work for inshore AoS. Natural England set up a table apart from the discussion spaces where any stakeholder could meet and discuss issues with them. The JNCC presentations are available as PDF files here:
- **There were four parallel small group sessions**, and each ran four times, ensuring that all participants had the opportunity to discuss each Area. The results of these are below.
- **The final session of the day** was a Question and Answer session with a panel of those who had led the small groups along with Jon Davies and Paul McLeod (see section 6 below).
- **Day 2 started with presentations by:**
 - Jon Davies who summarised the 'Key Messages from Day 1' http://jncc.defra.gov.uk/pdf/JNCC_MCZ_Workshop_Day1-Feedback.pdf which summarised concerns and agreed actions.
 - Laura Cornick (Senior MPA Advisor, JNCC) on JNCC's role in the provision of conservation advice for the MCZs and how this is done. She also set out the process and desired outcomes for the second session of small group discussions.
- **There were four more breakout sessions.** Again each ran four times, ensuring that all participants had the opportunity to discuss each Area. The results of these are below.
- **The final session** (after lunch) included:

- summary presentations of the key points that had emerged in the small group discussions.
- a presentation by Jon Davies on 'Next steps in the MCZ work programme' explaining how work will move forward now we have discussed the developing AoS with the stakeholders.
- A final question and discussion session which led to the close of the event.

4. The opening sessions - main presentations

The presentations from the first two sessions are available as PDF files on the JNCC website: <http://jncc.defra.gov.uk/page-7325>.

5. Breakout Session 1.

Four breakout groups ran in parallel. Each of these groups covered a specific AoS:

- Breakout A: South of Chesil Beach in the Eastern Channel region;
- Breakout B: East of Start Point in the Eastern Channel region;
- Breakout C: West of Lundy in the Western Channel region;
- Breakout D: West of Copeland in the Irish Sea region.

There were four sequential sessions, and all four breakout groups ran in each session. This enabled all participants to engage with and comment on each AoS. Each group was supported by three JNCC staff (a facilitator, a note taker and a GIS operator). All attendees had been given information about these sites in the Workshop Guide (circulated in advance) and were also asked two specific questions:

- Are there particular parts of the Areas of Search that are of greater interest to you?
- Are there additional human activity or marine habitats and species datasets available in relation to the Areas of Search that we have missed?

Reports on these sessions are available on the JNCC website: <http://jncc.defra.gov.uk/page-7325>.

6. Issues arising at the end of Day 1

A range of questions and points were raised in the final session. The NGOs present (Royal Society of Wildlife Trusts, World Wide Fund for Nature, Marine Conservation Society and Friends of the Earth) expressed their shared support the current AoS.

JNCC staff committed to a number of actions arising from Day 1:

- Share GIS files / coordinates of areas with workshop participants by 18 Nov 2016
- Follow up offers of data & information – these will be required by early Dec 2016

- Review available data for alternative locations – an update is due to accompany this workshop report
- Review all questions posed during breakout sessions and where possible, offer answers, in the workshop report by end Nov 2016

7. Breakout Session 2.

The focus on these sessions was on JNCC's approach to Conservation Advice to inform possible management of MCZ features. Six summary conservation advice documents for MCZ features were circulated.

Each of these groups covered a specific biogeographic region and all of the potential Tranche Three options within these regions:

- Breakout A: North Sea;
- Breakout B: Eastern Channel;
- Breakout C: Western Channel and Celtic Sea;
- Breakout D: Irish Sea region.

The discussions covered AoS, rMCZs options and the key features for each area.

Reports on these sessions are available on the JNCC website: <http://jncc.defra.gov.uk/page-7325>.

8. Next steps

A short presentation by Jon Davies on Day 2 issues is here:

http://jncc.defra.gov.uk/pdf/JNCC_MCZ_Workshop_Day2-Feedback.pdf

8.1 Timeline

JNCC outlined what would happen in the coming months:

- Firstly, all data will be collated from the workshop;
- JNCC will follow up with relevant parties on bringing new data into the system;
- There may be some reconsideration in the light of this work;
- JNCC needs to provide formal scientific advice to Defra by Feb. 2017;
- Final proposals may be shared with stakeholders before this;
- There may be possibilities for one-to-one meetings with stakeholder groups;
- Defra will do analysis and bring forward proposal for all sites / options for competing the network and minimising impacts;
- This will lead to recommendations to Minister on the 3rd Tranche;
- A formal consultation process managed by Defra will take place in summer 2017;
- Designations are set for mid/late 2018.

8.2 Data and Conservation Advice issues

Stakeholders stressed the need for the best possible and most up-to-date evidence and data. There were questions as to whether some of the sensitivity tables are outdated? JNCC responded that they need to give information on General Management Approach for each area and want the best sensitivities / activities data.

There were a range of related data issues:

- Issues around availability, currency and quality of data came up in various sessions;
- JNCC gather and assess data and work to key agreed protocols;
- More direct data gathering / survey work would depend on availability of funding;
- There will be ongoing surveys of designated sites and monitoring.

It was generally recognised that we need to be clear on data issues, and this ties in to monitoring: we need the data systems for the issues that we need to monitor / measure.

8.3 The benefits of this approach

Some stakeholders pointed out that short-term impacts and costs do figure largely in these discussions. There remains a question as to how can the long-term benefits of the MPA network be integrated into this work at this stage?

It was acknowledged that monetising benefits is much harder to do. Defra is looking to do what they can on this: “just because we cannot monetise at this time doesn’t mean we don’t care”.

There is a real need to share the knowledge of the benefits and this is an international concern.

8.4 Displacement

Others added that the full costs also need to be understood, including the impacts of displacement of fishing activity. There are further issues around ecological impacts (‘beyond OSPAR’) and there may be displacement issues linked to this. Natural England is developing a project on displacement.

It is recognised that selection of areas is affected by economic issues – and a tendency to choose less-fished areas, although this was disputed in the Holderness area.

8.5 Sufficiency of proposals

Defra were asked what would happen if enough areas do not emerge from this work to meet the targets. Paul McLeod stated that they are happy that what is proposed will deliver – “it’s what we have” - and that JNCC are putting forward sufficient proposals.

8.6 Next steps

In closing JNCC set out some immediate actions:

- JNCC will send out summary slides and maps;
- Some further bilateral meetings are being planned;
- The workshop report will be circulated;
- Stakeholder comments will go to Defra with JNCC/Natural England scientific advice;
- SeaSketch (see Workshop Guide) will remain open with the forums and it can be used to provide data and site options;
- Data can be submitted to JNCC via email;
- JNCC are considering the best options for further engagement in early 2017 on site proposals.

This report prepared for JNCC by Chris Church (Community Environment Associates) who facilitated the workshop.

Annex 1: List of Attendees

Organisation	Name
Agri-Food and Biosciences Institute (AFBI)	Matt Service
British Ports Association	Mark Simmonds
Brittany Fishermen's Organisation	Baptiste Cautain
French Government	Marion Cuif
Friends of the Earth	Sion Elis Williams
Holderness Fishing Industry Group	Mike Cohen
Lower-Normandy Regional Fisheries Committee	Alexia Courdant
Lower-Normandy Regional Fisheries Committee	Lucile Aumont
Marine Conservation Society (MCS)	Jean-Luc Solandt
Marine Conservation Society (MCS)	Melissa Moore
Marine Management Organisation (MMO)	Nicholas Greenwood
Marine Management Organisation (MMO)	Victoria Metheringham
Ministry of Defence (MoD)	Delphine Coates
National Federation of Fishermen's Organisations (NFFO)	Dale Rodmell

National Federation of Fishermen's Organisations (NFFO)	Steve Parker
Natural Resources Wales (NRW)	Daniel Crook
North Devon UNESCO World Biosphere	Andrew Bell
Rederscentrale	Sander Meyns
Regional Committee of Marine Fisheries (North)	Antony Viera
Regional Fisheries Committee of Upper Normandy	Antoine Balazuc
Royal Society for the Protection of Birds (RSPB)	Gareth Cunningham
Royal Society for the Protection of Birds (RSPB)	Katharine Holmes
South West Fish Producers Organisation Ltd (SWFPO)	Jim Portus
The Crown Estate	Rosie Kelly
The Scottish White Fish Producers Association Ltd	Iain Young
The Wildlife Trusts (TWT)	Joan Edwards
The Wildlife Trusts (TWT)	Lissa Batey
University of the West of England (UWE)	Thomas Appleby
VisNed	Wouter van Broekhoven
Welsh Government (Marine and Fisheries Division)	Sharon Davies
World Wildlife Fund (WWF)	Alec Taylor

Annex 2: List of staff

Organisation	Name
Defra	Paul McLeod
JNCC	Hannah Carr
JNCC	Pete Chaniotis
JNCC	Bekah Cioffi
JNCC	Laura Cornick
JNCC	Alice Cornthwaite
JNCC	Alexandra Cunha
JNCC	Jon Davies
JNCC	Beckie Langton
JNCC	Emma Novak

JNCC	Berta Ramiro Sanchez
JNCC	Sophie Rush
JNCC	Rebekah Strong
JNCC	Declan Tobin
Natural England	Mark Duffy
Natural England	Andrew Knights
Natural England	Heidi Pardoe
Natural England	Ian Saunders